Surveillance & female participation
Post-colonialism & intersectionality
Male roles in comic series
Paternalistic images of power
Masculinity in West & East
Translating the global gender agenda

Gender & post-Soviet discourses
Introduction. Gender and post-Soviet discourses

During the last decade, the debates about social transformations in post-Soviet countries have mainly been focused on whether these processes have come to an end, what kind of trajectory they have had, and, most importantly, whether it is possible to place countries so different from one another under the common rubric “post-Soviet.”

In this issue, we take up this discussion using the framework of gender studies, providing the reader with the perspectives of researchers who have lived and worked in the “post-Soviet” countries and whose research is primarily concerned with that topic.

The idea to put together this special Baltic Worlds section, “Gender and post-Soviet discourses,” was much inspired by a workshop with the same name that took place in May 2013 at Södertörn University, which is on state surveillance apparatuses, both online and offline. The role of the state in defining the limits of workers and how they live and act within their “unique national identity.”

What does this tendency mean to the scholars focusing on gender issues? Our contributors show that gender today bears not only a political issue, but also a political trigger. It becomes a platform for political domination and ideology mainstreaming as well as for political activism and engagement. Whether our authors talk about online political activists, the portrayal of Fathers of the Nation, or comic books and education, gender appears as a conjunction between the past and the present, where the established present seems to not recognize the past, but at the same time eagerly renews the past discourses of domination.

These discourses of domination are constructed through various dimensions. In this issue, we try to provide an interdisciplinary perspective on gender in post-Soviet discourses in which the contributors focus not only on gender, but also on class, ethnic, racial, and religious background, and on sexual identity.

The issue opens with an article by Marina Tostenova, who looks at the importance and specificity of the geopolitical positioning in postsozialist gendered discourses using Central Asia and the Caucasus as graphic examples and highlighting the intersection of the postsozialist and the postcolonial.

Ilkn Mehriban continues the discussion on the southern Caucasus by addressing the political challenges and threats to female online activists and journalists in Azerbaijan. Her main focus is on state surveillance apparatuses, both online and offline.

Rounding out the issue is Yulia Gradskova’s essay, which reveals some of the possible reasons behind the problems we have highlighted in this introduction, one of which is gender equality being “lost in translation” into national languages and local discourses.

We are delighted that this issue appears as a forum for both emerging and established scholars who are engaging in an exciting discussion about gender and post-Soviet discourses.

Lidiudina Voronova, Ekaterina Kalina
Department of Media and Communication, Södertörn University.

references
1 The post-soviet space includes 14 independent states that emerged from the Soviet Union after its dissolution in 1991. The states form five groups: the Russian Federation (recognised as a successor state to the USSR); the Baltic states – Estonia, Latvia and Lithuania; East-Central Europe – Ukraine, Belarus and Moldova; the Southern Caucasus – Armenia, Georgia, and Azerbaijan; Central Asia – Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Tajikistan, Turkmenistan, and Uzbekistan.
2 The workshop “Gender and Post-Soviet Discourses” was sponsored by the Centre for Baltic and East European Studies (CBEESE) at Södertörn University and by the academic network CERES (http://www.helsinki.fi/alokoanti/voor/). See e.g. Bikbo Basko 2007, in eds., Gender Transformations in Russia and Eastern Europe (Gendrinin ja Eesti ajaloo) 2005; Nikole Stampova and Elena Kochkina, eds., Gender, race, and ethnicity in Russian literature and culture (INCRRA, November 13, 2007). See also: http://www.sos kinky/.
3 See e.g. Bikbo Basko 2007, in eds., Gender Transformations in Russia and Eastern Europe (Gendrinin ja Eesti ajaloo) 2005; Nikole Stampova and Elena Kochkina, eds., Gender, race, and ethnicity in Russian literature and culture (INCRRA, November 13, 2007). See also: http://www.sos kinky/.
8 Paternalistic images of power in Soviet photograph, Ekaterina Vikulina.
9 Searching for new male identity: going west or going back? Dani Dmitrieva.
10 Studies on men and masculinities in Ukraine: see Dani Dmitrieva’s recent work on masculinity and intersectional coalitions, Tlostanova.
11 Translating “gender equality”: Northwestern Russia meets the global gender equality agenda, Yuliya Gradskova.

Lidiudina Voronova
PhD in media and communication studies, Södertörn University. Currently working with the questions of Russian patriotism, biopolitics, nostalgia, and national identity. Also manages cultural projects and conduct research on cross-cultural artistic practices in Norden.

Ekaterina Kalina
PhD in media and communication studies, Södertörn University. Currently working as a project coordinator at Nordkonst and associated professor of gender studies at Södertörn University. Her research centers on feminist and queer theory, European ethnography, and histories of gender studies, among other things. Currently she leads the project Queering kinship in the Baltic region.

Ulrika Dahl
Cultural anthropologist and associate professor of gender studies at Södertörn University. Her research centers on feminist and queer theory, European ethnography, and histories of gender studies, among other things. Currently she leads the project Queering kinship in the Baltic region.
Postcolonial post-Soviet trajectories and intersectional coalitions

by Madina Tlostanova

With the collapse of the Soviet Union, many nations and ethnicities artificially collected under the umbrella of the Soviet empire — the so-called Second World of the Cold War era — have started their centrifugal movement away from the metropolis in quest of other vassals, partners, and zones of belonging and influence. This process has been ongoing for over two decades. Today, not only the CIS but also Russia itself with its remaining colonies (e.g., the Northern Caucasus) seems to have lost all of its cultural bonds, except for linguistic ones. There are no values or goals left to link the millions who had the misfortune of being born in this huge and uncontrollable territory. Yet a number of scholars still insist on the existence of some common post-Soviet imaginary, most probably doomed to be erased, museumized, and/or commodified with the stage exit of the last generation of people formed in the USSR. This imaginary is grounded in a specific spatial history, generating unhomed subjects forced to survive from the non-European post-Soviet ex-colonies and their neocolonial leadership. Consequently, the non-European post-Soviet ex-colonies have no choice but to reproduce their doubly colonized status, or to build coalitions with de-Westernizing China, Malaysia, the Arab Emirates, or Turkey. The latter option does not automatically guarantee a better attitude on the part of the coalition partners, but it at least leaves behind the old Orientalism and progressivism that stalled relations with both Russia and the West. It is important to take into account the gaps between the official politics of the post-Soviet states and their neocolonial leaders, and the grass-roots social movements that are connected with common people’s efforts to survive, and that lead to the mass migration and diasporic existence of millions of dispensable lives.

In this context it is important to take into account the politics of location in knowledge production, in Adrienne Rich’s words, the situated knowledges, as Donna Haraway would have it, the “small stories, situated in specific local contexts” according to Nina Lykke, or the pluriversality in the formulation of the decolonial option. Pluriversality is a coexistence of many interacting and intersecting non-abstract universals grounded in the geopolitics and body politics of knowledge, being, and perception, in a conscious effort to reconnect theory and theorists with experience, with those who are discriminated against, to restate the experiential nature of knowledge and the origin of all theory in the human lifeworld and experience. The decolonial option stresses our inescapable localization in the colonial matrix of power that cannot be observed from the outside — from the convenient vantage point of God or Reason — as the products of the colonial matrix promoted through its enunciators. They present their option as an abstract universal, hiding its locality and appropriating diversity in the form of its control by universal epistemology as demonstrated in numerous multicultural projects. In the pluriversal world where many worlds coexist and interact, countless options communicate with one another instead of promoting one abstract universal good for all. These options intersect, sometimes inside our bodies and selves, and each locus of intersection is an option. Decolonial pluriversality is parallel to intersectionality, but operates on a different level: its target is not the constellation of race, gender, class, and other power asymmetries, but rather the alienation of the universal as such.

The geopolitics of knowledge and the post-Soviet women

Geopolitical positioning has long been an important element of intersectionality as exemplified in women of color and transnational feminisms. Nina Lykke points out that the analysis of geopolitical positioning “requires a self reflexive stance on global/local locations not only in relation to crude and rather abstract categories such as East-West/North-South [...]. It is necessary to engage in much more detailed reflections on unequal relationships between nations, regions, mother tongues, and so on and to analyze the ways in which you generate various kinds of problematic methodological particularisms or universalisms in research.”

This observation is particularly true in relation to the experience of the post-Soviet women who are today either aspiring, in the endless catching up logic, the status of the second generation of the First World, or sliding from the position of the honorary Second World to that of the global South, marked by the secondary colonial difference and acting as the subalterns of the subaltern empire Russia, multiplying the numbers of dispensable lives unable and unwilling to fully share the postcolonial stance. From the specific Soviet modernity with its own colonialism, we shift to the situation of global, neoliberal colonialism, equating in a way the ex-colonizers with the ex-subalterns, casting us all out from modernity and making the postcolonial subject silent and invisible, yet able to retain the internal power asymmetries and discriminations not always visible to the external observer. For instance, the post-Soviet racial taxonomy and normalized epistemic asymmetry still tags everyone with Asian or Caucasian blood as underdeveloped and arrested “savages” — until we theorize any experience including our own particularly if this experience includes an obvious racial and gender discrimination on the part of the Russian state and the Russian majority in power — and dictates that the non-European, post-Soviet gender theorists occupy the position of native informants and diligent pupils of their Russian and/or European teachers. An Egyptian writer and gender activist, Nawal el Saadawi, detected a similar syndrome in a Wellesley conference on women's
and development. “The well-meaning US organizers . . . had no idea how paternalistic and condescending they sounded, in both words and attitudes, when they read papers or talked at the participants, telling them how to behave . . . . For the US organizers, power was not the issue, because they had it, and thought it normal for us not to participate . . . . The organizers had the capacity to turn the Third World women’s protests into ‘personal defects.’” Something similar is to be found in the post-Soviet space with its silences and omissions, unspoken resentment and continu- nder such conditions, whether in Russia or beyond, whether in the domain of individual agency and social change. The specific Soviet experience of one emancipation and efforts to create its own New Woman in her metropolitan and colonial versions, grounded in the double standards and reticence that was typi- cal of the whole Soviet system, places the gendered subjects of the ex-colonies of Russia and the USSR into conditions that are not quite postcolonial and not entirely postsocialist, and that cannot be attributed to race, ethnicity, or religion, nor to ideology and class. Yet in the continuing situation of epistemic power asymmetries, the nuances of the Soviet gender trajectories, to say nothing of the presocialist local genealogies of women’s struggles and resistance, tend to be erased.

MARIA MATUSA URGES us to “ask the other question” in order to avoid the inevitable blind spots in intersectional investigations. She suggests that we include categories that would not appear obvious in this or that particular study, which of course enriches the complexity and subtlety of intersectional analysis: “When I see something that looks racist, I ask, ‘Where is the patriarchy in this?’ When I see something that looks sexist, I ask, ‘Where is the heterosexism in this?’ When I see something that looks homophobic, I ask, ‘Where is the class interest in this?’” This is crucial for any effort to understand the situation of non-Russian women from the former and present colonies of the Russian/Soviet empire. A good example in this case is the flat and frozen interpre- tation of veiled Caucasian women exclusively through terrorist discourses as black widows and potential suicide bombers.

The hijab and the trajectory of Central Asian women

For a limited number of Caucasian women, the hijab indeed becomes a sign of political-cum-religious identity, as in other Muslim locales in the world. Yet there is a large group of women in the Caucasus who choose to veil themselves for reasons other than religion or politics. In this case we find a specific intersection of class, religion, and ethnicity which does not eas- ily yield to the simple “but for” logic. These women obviously experience discrimination when they travel to Moscow or other predominantly Russian cities. Yet in their native republics they are often marked by the hijab as possessing a certain social status, not anything religious as such, but rather a piece whose Muslim interpretation mingles with the ethnic-national tradi- tional ethnic codes. These are mostly middle class women for whom it is prestigious to cover themselves. (In some cases, it is a necessary condition for a good marriage; in other, it is a play on a stylized archaization, the construction of a halal self, similar to subcultural youth identities, behind which often stands an urge to become rooted in an essentialized or escapist identity.) Ostracized as potential terrorists in the Moscow metro, in their own world they would show a condescending attitude to those women who cannot afford a good, expensive hijab and who simi- ilar to subcultural youth identities, behind which often stands an urge to become rooted in an essentialized or escapist identity.) Ostracized as potential terrorists in the Moscow metro, in their own world they would show a condescending attitude to those women who cannot afford a good, expensive hijab and who simi- ilar to subcultural youth identities, behind which often stands an urge to become rooted in an essentialized or escapist identity.) Ostracized as potential terrorists in the Moscow metro, in their own world they would show a condescending attitude to those women who cannot afford a good, expensive hijab and who simi- lar to subcultural youth identities, behind which often stands an urge to become rooted in an essentialized or escapist identity.) Ostracized as potential terrorists in the Moscow metro, in their own world they would show a condescending attitude to those women who cannot afford a good, expensive hijab and who simi- lar to subcultural youth identities, behind which often stands an urge to become rooted in an essentialized or escapist identity.) Ostracized as potential terrorists in the Moscow metro, in their own world they would show a condescending attitude to those women who cannot afford a good, expensive hijab and who simi- lar to subcultural youth identities, behind which often stands an urge to become rooted in an essentialized or escapist identity.) Ostracized as potential terrorists in the Moscow metro, in their own world they would show a condescending attitude to those women who cannot afford a good, expensive hijab and who simi- lar to subcultural youth identities, behind which often stands an urge to become rooted in an essentialized or escapist identity.) Ostracized as potential terrorists in the Moscow metro, in their own world they would show a condescending attitude to those women who cannot afford a good, expensive hijab and who simi-
The complex indigenous cosmologies, ethics and gender models discordant with modernism and colonialism are erased or negatively coded, even in the works of indigenous scholars, who are forced to buy their way into academia by conforming to Western mainstream gender research. So the tripartite scheme of the colonial and ex-colonial post-Soviet gendered Others persists: it sees women as forever climbing the stairs of modernity – from traditionalism through the Soviet half-traditional, half-modern model to the Western liberal female.14 In contrast with Chinese gender theorists, who refused to walk the metaphor of universal feminism wearing Western shoes uncomfortably for their feet – for the simple reason that they had already walked a long way on their own path,5 gender discourses in peripheral Eurasia often remain in the grip of progressivism and developmentalism. It thus becomes all the more important for the ex-colonial, postcolonial gendered Others to get acquainted with some alternative non-Western approaches to gender, to be ‘indocmented’ by6 the theorists and activists of the Global South. There is still little reciprocal interest between the ex-socialist postcolonial world and the global South. The global South was disappointed in the ex-socialist world, which failed to accomplish its expansionist mission. It still also codes ‘postcolonial’ in ideological, not racial terms. As a result, gender activists are seldom ready to accept the equation between colonialism and modernity, or between Western Orientalism and non-Western resistance. The obvious reason for this is economic and institutional. The massive indocmentation of Western feminism, supported by grants and advice, would go beyond ideological demands in the first post-Soviet years, resulted in the emergence of many gender centers and programs willing to start from scratch, as if there had been no Soviet history of gender struggles. Or, in some cases, the history was an obstacle, yet interpreted by the mostly metropolitan post-Soviet scholars utilizing Western approaches such as post-Lacanian psychoanalysis. This syndrome is obviously a manifestation of a new kind of mind-colonization, which has resulted in an unhealthy self-orientalizing and self-negation on the part of the ex-colonial Others7 that is hard to resolve.

INTERSECTIONALITIES, CREATIVITY, TRANSVERSALITY, AND ENCOUNTERS

The intercessionality would develop in the direction of an open creolized theorizing as defined by Françoise Lionnet and Shu-mei Shih: “Creolized theory is open to vernacular grammars, methods, and lexicons […] in the sense that it is a living practice that precedes yet calls for theorization while resisting ossification.” Creolized theory enables unexpected comparisons and the use of different analytical tools. It becomes “urgent to attempt theory in the many idioms and languages that are congruent with our diverse orientations as transnational producers of knowledge.”8

**Open and Critical, intersectionality helps to make a shift towards a more conscious agency, laying the groundwork for a future solidarity. Transversal crossings of activism, theorizing, and, often, contemporary art, are among the most effective tools in social and political struggles against multiple oppressions and in the creation of another world where many different worlds would coexist and communicate with one another in a positive and creative way. Mother and daughter figures at restoring human dignity and the right to be different but equal. It is necessary to further elaborate an open critical basin that would take into account the existing parallels between various echoing concepts and epistemic grounds of gender discourses and would find an interdisciplinary, but better yet, translanguid discourse for expressing oppositional gendered being, thinking, and agency across the transcultural and transpentimental pluralistic loci. Then the post-Soviet non-European gendered Others can finally hope to exercise our right to keep our dignity and no longer plead to be accepted by the West, the global North, or Russia.**

---

**references**

1. Aleksandr Germanov. "Gejneuologiya: Aino Ameri da okej ne brove" [Geonomics: About America and His life Work]. Moscow: Drozdu, 2008. Video. Accessed January 10, 2014, http://yandex.ru/video/search?text=%D0%9A%D0%B0%D0%B3%D0%B8%D0%BD%D1%86%D0%B5%D0%BD%D1%82%D0%B8%D0%BD%D0%B0&isOnlyVideo=true


Gendered surveillance and media usage in post-Soviet space
The case of Azerbaijan

by Ilkin Mehrabov

abstract
This article is an attempt to explore the limits of gendered surveillance in Azerbaijan – that is, how and to what extent female activists and women journalists are monitored and affected by surveillance apparatuses of the state, both online and offline. The article also briefly examines the gender dimension of Azerbaijan’s political activism and protest practices, and how the gender stereotypes, together with the more general problem of the digital gender gap, are being used by the state authorities to control public opinion. The conceptual framework of the article is based upon two main sources of information: the ethnographic narrativation of Khadija Ismayilova’s case in conjunction with an electronic correspondence conducted with her on March 30, 2013; and quantitative analysis of Internet connectivity data in Azerbaijan, obtained from the Caucasus Research Resource Centers’ Caucasus Barometer 2012 Azerbaijan survey.

The case of Azerbaijan
Khadija Ismayilova’s case is an illuminating example of how semi-authoritarian governments are engaging in disruptive moves against disagreeable journalists and political opponents based on the normative gender dynamics that exist in various socio-cultural contexts. Within this scope, this article is an attempt to explore the limits of gendered surveillance in Azerbaijan – that is, how and to what extent female activists and women journalists are monitored and affected by what I call the surveillance apparatuses of the state, both online and offline. The article also briefly examines the gender dimension of Azerbaijan’s political activism and protest practices, and how the gender stereotypes, together with the more general problem of the digital gender gap, are being used by the state authorities to control public opinion. The conceptual framework of the article is based upon two main sources of information: the ethnographic narrativation of Khadija Ismayilova’s case in conjunction with an electronic correspondence conducted with her on March 30, 2013; and quantitative analysis of Internet connectivity data in Azerbaijan, obtained from the Caucasus Research Resource Centers’ Caucasus Barometer 2012 Azerbaijan survey.

Gender and offline surveillative apparatuses in Azerbaijan
Azerbaijan currently ranks 177 among the 196 studied countries (Sweden and Norway head the list) in the Freedom of the Press 2013 report of the Freedom House; it ranks 196 among the 179 countries in the Reporters without Borders’ 2013 World Press Freedom Index; and, according to the Committee to Protect Journalists, is among the “top 10 worst jailers of journalists” in the world. But what happened to Khadija Ismayilova was extremely shocking even under the circumstances of a country where people are accustomed to frequent mistreatment and jailing of journalists. The blow was so low that, contrary to the blackmailers’ expectations – those who had demanded that she “abandon her investigation of links between President Ilham Aliyev’s political circles”,8 that her life was saved. As a result of the journalist’s keen insistence in trying to uncover who was behind the attempt to blackmail her with the sex video, events unfolded in a way such that “Ismayilova did not bide. Instead, she tracked the letter to a Moscow post office. She discovered curious wires inside her apartment and then found the phone company worker hired to install them”9 — and due to her investigations it was revealed that the camera was set up in her bedroom in July 2011, almost eight months before the blackmailing attempt took place. This incident caused a number of heated debates among the local and global human rights and media advocacy groups, as Ismayilova is not the first Azerbaijani journalist to fall victim to such an attack. Other victims include editor-in-chief of “Azadliq” newspaper Ganimat Zahid, finance director Azer Ahmadov and reporters Natig Gulahmadoglu and Gan Tural. Video clips containing intimate scenes were posted on internet, in violation of the journalists’ privacy. This pattern indicates that the Azerbaijani government, illegally deploying the technical and human resources of intelligence agencies, repeatedly organizes centralized smear campaigns against journalists who publish material critical of the government.10

All the people cited above, in a quotation taken from the Institute for Reporters’ Freedom and Safety’s declaration about the case, are male journalists, with the exception of Khadija Ismayilova, who so far is the only woman publicist to be targeted with such defamation and shaming campaign attempting to silence her critical reporting. According to Ismayilova herself, there are no other accounts of female journalists or activists who were...
Khadija Ismayilova received the prestigious Courage in Journalism Award from the International Women’s Media Foundation (IFM) in a 2012 Los Angeles ceremony.

ever targeted in such ways or imprisoned – except for the very few examples of women protesters being taken into short term custody or put into jail for brief, token periods of time, like the five-day prison term of Gozel Bayramova, deputy head of the Institute of Peace and Democracy, and Shahnaz Ismayilova, deputy defender working on the issues of political prisoners; and then Khadija Ismayilova herself, also clearly indicated, national law enforcement agen-
cies, and hence surveillance apparatuses, are rapidly shifting towards a more gender neutral position. Now, when it comes to the defamation of political opponents, smear campaigns against disgusting journalists, or the jailing of professionals with op-
positional stances, there are no gender differences anymore, and women are targeted in exactly the same way as their male counterparts. The similar trait can be observed when skimming through recent Azerbaijani photos and videos as well, which are filled with disturbing imagery of women activ-
ists being verbally and physically harassed, emotionally abused, forcefully dragged away, or bodily beaten by police officers, military personnel, security guards, civil agents and other re-
presentatives of various law enforcement agencies. So, in the real, offline world, women now started to be treated in the most brutal ways, paralleling the treatment of male dissidents and journalists – the clear surveillance of their intimate lives or the outright violence against them. Such transformation invites a closer look at the situation of women activists in the online realm.

**Between modernism and traditionalism: Azerbaijani women online**

Despite the numerous claims that most of the imprisoned Azer-
baijani male dissidents were closely monitored and detected with pinpoint accuracy through their social media communica-
tions and usage – such as Jabbar Savalan, a 20-year-old student and former member of an oppositional youth organization, being taken into custody “after he posted on Facebook calling for a ‘Day of Rage’ in Freedom Square in Baku, echoing the calls for protest in the Middle East” – there is no known example of any female activist being specifically targeted for her online presence and activities. Based also on the thorough quantitative and qualita-
tive analysis of 2003-2013 Azerbaijani offline and online protests – the subject of another study seeking to build a categorical map of protests in Azerbaijan, which is not reproduced here due to the space constraints – it can be argued that the surveillance apparatuses of Azerbaijan, aiming to monitor and keep under control Internet users’ online media and social networking prac-
tices, are currently targeting male activists only, since there are no clear indicators that the women protesters are kept under the close online surveillance as well. It can be speculated with some confidence that the national surveillance apparatuses are not fully aimed at women yet, or, to be more precise, there is no per-
suasive evidence that the same measures – taken to prevent an online call for action from turning into an actual offline protest, as in the case of Jabbar Savalan – are being used against women within the online world. Several phenomena could explain this.

**First of all, despite all the secularization and modernization processes Azerbaijan has undergone during the Soviet era, it is still very much a traditionalist country, where most of the male politicians and bureaucrats put constant emphasis on family values and “women’s primary identities as mothers and wives” – despite the fact that Azerbaijan has one of the highest ratios of female parliamentarians among post-Soviet countries. In this sense it is very hard to disagree with Manijeh Sabi’s claim that “Azerbaijan society remains as a fortress for patriarchy”; it is also not very easy to explain an “inconsistency between women’s economic participation in the labor force and formal emancipation of women on the one hand and their apparently subservient attitudinal and behavioral dispositions of women in the online world” – as a result of the preferences of their male relatives and thus mostly remain-
ing “locked in tradition-bound roles as moth-
ers, wives, sisters, and daughters”. Within the socio-cultural context of such a dominant patriarchy – where women are already heavily monitored and patronized within the course of everyday life through the normative gender codes established by their fathers, brothers and husbands – very little state effort is required for the additional monitoring of women’s online behavior and conduct. And most of the time – due to the country’s extremely low Internet penetration – such state surveillance might not even be necessary, since, despite all the claims of government officials for establishing widespread and far-reaching Internet connectivity within Azerbaijan, analysis of actual numbers reveals gloomy picture, especially in relation to women’s Internet usage. As the figure provided above clearly shows, only 15% of 711 women respondents of Caucasus Research Resource Centers’ Caucasian Barometer 2013 Azerbaijan survey use the Internet fre-
quently, if at all, and an astonishing 80% either have never used it or do not even know what the Internet is. By combining Face-
dbook’s own Ads selling program data with the World Bank’s de-
scriptive information, Kay E. Price, assistant professor at the University of Washington, and one of the leading experts on information-communication technologies usage in South Cau-
casus, provides a much more elaborated and detailed analysis of Facebook usage, “social exchange platform claimed to be carefully watched by the national law enforcement and intelligence agen-
cies in Azerbaijan,” according to Dr. Pearce’s calculations, only 36% of Facebook users in Azerbaijan are women – whereas in neighboring Armenia the gender balance of users is fairly even; and in Georgia there are about 10% more women than men on Facebook. In this sense, the low number of people and house-
holds having an Internet connection, combined with the much lower percentage of women compared with men – using the Internet in everyday life, might explain the lack of evidence of surveillance of online women activists.

**Concluding remarks**

Although the conditions of the Azerbaijani female activists de-
picted here might seem depressing – with women dissidents being surveilled and intimidated in the offline world because of their professional roles and oppositional positions, and the lack of women in the online realm – not everything is so gloomy. The case of Khadija Ismayilova being blackmailed with a sex video proved the emergence of something extraordinarily different in relation to the classic operational grounds of Azerbaijani online and offline female activism. The attempt to silence a woman journalist through a defamation campaign based on her private life was widely discussed, especially in the Facebook forums of religious women dissidents; and although many of these reli-
gious women did not approve of premartial sex at all, the plain fact that this most intimate moment was recorded and distrib-
uted through the Internet, with the putative governmental involve-
ment, elicited open criticism and public condemnation. Such an expression of strong solidarity of religious women with Khadija Ismayilova’s quest for justice might also explain – although this is purely speculative – the fact that the currently low number of women connected to the Internet, there is a growing tendency among Azerbaijani women’s organizations and female activists to build websites, start discussion forums, and establish Face-
b ook groups – indicators of a healthy growth of Internet portals and milieus related to women’s issues, which might foster a dialog and mutual understanding among women with different backgrounds.

Ikin Mehrotra, Department of Geography, Media and Communication Studies, Karlstad University, Sweden.

**References**


2. Caucasian Barometer is the annual household survey about social and economic issues, as well as political attitudes, conducted by the Caucasus Research Resource Centers (CRRC). CRRC’s Caucasian Barometer 2013 Azerbaijan survey was conducted nationwide between October 1, 2011, and November 2, 2011, and it totalled 430 adults of at least 18 years of age (of which 48% were women) were interviewed face-to-face using the Azerbaijani language.

3. The report states that the situation in Azerbaijan worsened compared with previous years, mainly “due to an increase in violence against journalists and legal amendments that limited access to information”:

4. Reporters without Borders report states that the current situation in Azerbaijan indicates that “press freedom is now shrouded in darkness after a series of repressions during the first six months of 2014,” and the report notes that Azerbaijan “ranked 16th out of 180 countries” in terms of press freedom. And it also notes that the situation in Azerbaijan “worsened compared with previous years,” and that “a significant increase in violence against journalists and legal amendments that limited access to information.”

5. The report states that the situation in Azerbaijan “worsened compared with previous years, mainly “due to an increase in violence against journalists and legal amendments that limited access to information”:


7. IFP, “IFP/JRL Journalist Says She’s ‘Worse’ Intimidated by Blackmail...”

**Figure 1:** The distribution of Internet use by gender in Azerbaijan

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>Male</th>
<th>Female</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Every day</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>At least once a week</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Less often</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Never</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Frequency of Internet use by respondent’s sex (%)</th>
<th>Male</th>
<th>Female</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>At least once a week</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>At least once a month</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>At least once a year</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Never</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Paternalistic images of power in Soviet photography

by Ekaterina Vikulina

The focus of this study is the gender aspect of Soviet power, its focus, and its normative status in mass media representations, particularly in magazines. Dynamos of change were traced over a period of seventy years, from the beginning of the Soviet regime to its end. A period of such great length was chosen in order to delineate the full range of changes that took place during the Soviet era, changes that nonetheless overlay a certain continuity in the way media functioned as a means of regulating, controlling, and supporting a gender order.

The images of leaders and officials were published on the front pages of Soviet magazines and served as a pattern of gender representations of images. The images of the leaders in the widely distributed press played an important part in shaping the ideological platform in the Soviet Union, including the regulation, control and support of a certain gender order. The representation of gender was studied in the subjects of pictures of the country’s authors and heroes. A significant role in power representations was given to the body, which is the basis of ideological norms and rules.

KEYWORDS: Representation, gender, power, Soviet photography.

abstract

The study was based on the power images of the Soviet period during seventy years, from the beginning to the end of the Soviet regime. The images of the leaders in the widely distributed press played an important part in shaping the ideological platform in the Soviet Union, including the regulation, control and support of a certain gender order. The representation of gender was studied in the subjects of pictures of the country’s authors and heroes. A significant role in power representations was given to the body, which is the basis of ideological norms and rules.

Paternalistic images of power in Soviet photography

by Ekaterina Vikulina

The focus of this study is the gender aspect of Soviet power, its focus, and its normative status in mass media representations, particularly in magazines. Dynamos of change were traced over a period of seventy years, from the beginning of the Soviet regime to its end. A period of such great length was chosen in order to delineate the full range of changes that took place during the Soviet era, changes that nonetheless overlay a certain continuity in the way media functioned as a means of regulating, controlling, and supporting a gender order.

The images of leaders and officials were published on the front pages of Soviet magazines and served as a pattern of gender representations of images. The images of the leaders in the widely distributed press played an important part in shaping the ideological platform in the Soviet Union, including the regulation, control and support of a certain gender order. The representation of gender was studied in the subjects of pictures of the country’s authors and heroes. A significant role in power representations was given to the body, which is the basis of ideological norms and rules.

KEYWORDS: Representation, gender, power, Soviet photography.

abstract

The study was based on the power images of the Soviet pe- riod during seventy years, from the beginning to the end of the Soviet regime. The images of the leaders in the widely distributed press played an important part in shaping the ideological platform in the Soviet Union, including the regulation, control and support of a certain gender order. The representation of gender was studied in the subjects of pictures of the country’s authors and heroes. A significant role in power representations was given to the body, which is the basis of ideological norms and rules.

KEYWORDS: Representation, gender, power, Soviet photography.

The focus of this study is the gender aspect of Soviet power, its focus, and its normative status in mass media representations, particularly in magazines. Dynamos of change were traced over a period of seventy years, from the beginning of the Soviet regime to its end. A period of such great length was chosen in order to delineate the full range of changes that took place during the Soviet era, changes that nonetheless overlay a certain continuity in the way media functioned as a means of regulating, controlling, and supporting a gender order.

The images of leaders and officials were published on the front pages of Soviet magazines and served as a pattern of gender representations of images. The images of the leaders in the widely distributed press played an important part in shaping the ideological platform in the Soviet Union, including the regulation, control and support of a certain gender order. The representation of gender was studied in the subjects of pictures of the country’s authors and heroes. A significant role in power representations was given to the body, which is the basis of ideological norms and rules.

KEYWORDS: Representation, gender, power, Soviet photography.

The focus of this study is the gender aspect of Soviet power, its focus, and its normative status in mass media representations, particularly in magazines. Dynamos of change were traced over a period of seventy years, from the beginning of the Soviet regime to its end. A period of such great length was chosen in order to delineate the full range of changes that took place during the Soviet era, changes that nonetheless overlay a certain continuity in the way media functioned as a means of regulating, controlling, and supporting a gender order.

The images of leaders and officials were published on the front pages of Soviet magazines and served as a pattern of gender representations of images. The images of the leaders in the widely distributed press played an important part in shaping the ideological platform in the Soviet Union, including the regulation, control and support of a certain gender order. The representation of gender was studied in the subjects of pictures of the country’s authors and heroes. A significant role in power representations was given to the body, which is the basis of ideological norms and rules.

KEYWORDS: Representation, gender, power, Soviet photography.

The focus of this study is the gender aspect of Soviet power, its focus, and its normative status in mass media representations, particularly in magazines. Dynamos of change were traced over a period of seventy years, from the beginning of the Soviet regime to its end. A period of such great length was chosen in order to delineate the full range of changes that took place during the Soviet era, changes that nonetheless overlay a certain continuity in the way media functioned as a means of regulating, controlling, and supporting a gender order.

The images of leaders and officials were published on the front pages of Soviet magazines and served as a pattern of gender representations of images. The images of the leaders in the widely distributed press played an important part in shaping the ideological platform in the Soviet Union, including the regulation, control and support of a certain gender order. The representation of gender was studied in the subjects of pictures of the country’s authors and heroes. A significant role in power representations was given to the body, which is the basis of ideological norms and rules.

KEYWORDS: Representation, gender, power, Soviet photography.

The focus of this study is the gender aspect of Soviet power, its focus, and its normative status in mass media representations, particularly in magazines. Dynamos of change were traced over a period of seventy years, from the beginning of the Soviet regime to its end. A period of such great length was chosen in order to delineate the full range of changes that took place during the Soviet era, changes that nonetheless overlay a certain continuity in the way media functioned as a means of regulating, controlling, and supporting a gender order.

The images of leaders and officials were published on the front pages of Soviet magazines and served as a pattern of gender representations of images. The images of the leaders in the widely distributed press played an important part in shaping the ideological platform in the Soviet Union, including the regulation, control and support of a certain gender order. The representation of gender was studied in the subjects of pictures of the country’s authors and heroes. A significant role in power representations was given to the body, which is the basis of ideological norms and rules.

KEYWORDS: Representation, gender, power, Soviet photography.

The focus of this study is the gender aspect of Soviet power, its focus, and its normative status in mass media representations, particularly in magazines. Dynamos of change were traced over a period of seventy years, from the beginning of the Soviet regime to its end. A period of such great length was chosen in order to delineate the full range of changes that took place during the Soviet era, changes that nonetheless overlay a certain continuity in the way media functioned as a means of regulating, controlling, and supporting a gender order.

The images of leaders and officials were published on the front pages of Soviet magazines and served as a pattern of gender representations of images. The images of the leaders in the widely distributed press played an important part in shaping the ideological platform in the Soviet Union, including the regulation, control and support of a certain gender order. The representation of gender was studied in the subjects of pictures of the country’s authors and heroes. A significant role in power representations was given to the body, which is the basis of ideological norms and rules.

KEYWORDS: Representation, gender, power, Soviet photography.

The focus of this study is the gender aspect of Soviet power, its focus, and its normative status in mass media representations, particularly in magazines. Dynamos of change were traced over a period of seventy years, from the beginning of the Soviet regime to its end. A period of such great length was chosen in order to delineate the full range of changes that took place during the Soviet era, changes that nonetheless overlay a certain continuity in the way media functioned as a means of regulating, controlling, and supporting a gender order.

The images of leaders and officials were published on the front pages of Soviet magazines and served as a pattern of gender representations of images. The images of the leaders in the widely distributed press played an important part in shaping the ideological platform in the Soviet Union, including the regulation, control and support of a certain gender order. The representation of gender was studied in the subjects of pictures of the country’s authors and heroes. A significant role in power representations was given to the body, which is the basis of ideological norms and rules.

KEYWORDS: Representation, gender, power, Soviet photography.

The focus of this study is the gender aspect of Soviet power, its focus, and its normative status in mass media representations, particularly in magazines. Dynamos of change were traced over a period of seventy years, from the beginning of the Soviet regime to its end. A period of such great length was chosen in order to delineate the full range of changes that took place during the Soviet era, changes that nonetheless overlay a certain continuity in the way media functioned as a means of regulating, controlling, and supporting a gender order.

The images of leaders and officials were published on the front pages of Soviet magazines and served as a pattern of gender representations of images. The images of the leaders in the widely distributed press played an important part in shaping the ideological platform in the Soviet Union, including the regulation, control and support of a certain gender order. The representation of gender was studied in the subjects of pictures of the country’s authors and heroes. A significant role in power representations was given to the body, which is the basis of ideological norms and rules.

KEYWORDS: Representation, gender, power, Soviet photography.

The focus of this study is the gender aspect of Soviet power, its focus, and its normative status in mass media representations, particularly in magazines. Dynamos of change were traced over a period of seventy years, from the beginning of the Soviet regime to its end. A period of such great length was chosen in order to delineate the full range of changes that took place during the Soviet era, changes that nonetheless overlay a certain continuity in the way media functioned as a means of regulating, controlling, and supporting a gender order.

The images of leaders and officials were published on the front pages of Soviet magazines and served as a pattern of gender representations of images. The images of the leaders in the widely distributed press played an important part in shaping the ideological platform in the Soviet Union, including the regulation, control and support of a certain gender order. The representation of gender was studied in the subjects of pictures of the country’s authors and heroes. A significant role in power representations was given to the body, which is the basis of ideological norms and rules.

KEYWORDS: Representation, gender, power, Soviet photography.

The focus of this study is the gender aspect of Soviet power, its focus, and its normative status in mass media representations, particularly in magazines. Dynamos of change were traced over a period of seventy years, from the beginning of the Soviet regime to its end. A period of such great length was chosen in order to delineate the full range of changes that took place during the Soviet era, changes that nonetheless overlay a certain continuity in the way media functioned as a means of regulating, controlling, and supporting a gender order.

The images of leaders and officials were published on the front pages of Soviet magazines and served as a pattern of gender representations of images. The images of the leaders in the widely distributed press played an important part in shaping the ideological platform in the Soviet Union, including the regulation, control and support of a certain gender order. The representation of gender was studied in the subjects of pictures of the country’s authors and heroes. A significant role in power representations was given to the body, which is the basis of ideological norms and rules.

KEYWORDS: Representation, gender, power, Soviet photography.
A photographer’s selection of a frame is not accidental. He or she stops at one of the endless fragments of reality and makes a choice about its visual embodiment. This makes photos subjective, expressive of the author’s opinion, but at the same time, it transmits existing public views about the subject. As Peter Burke noted, what images record “is not social reality so much as social illusions, not ordinary life but special performances”, and that is why they offer unique evidence for the history of values or mentalities.4

Photography had a special role in representations of Soviet power. This medium had to certify a historical fact, to indicate the success of the socialist construct, to convince people who were reassessing communism. Nevertheless, attitudes towards photography as a propaganda tool changed throughout the Soviet period. Bold experiments of the 1920s, marked by a fascination with sharp angles and the technique of photomontage, were replaced during the Stalin period by caution, a fear of uncontrolled information, which led to the retouching of many photographs, transforming them into something with the poses and gestures found in the fine arts.

In turn, the democratization of Khrushchev’s image was closely related to the development of photography, the dissemination of amateur photography, and an extended arsenal of pictorial means and options. In the 1960s, photography was closely related to the development of photography, the dissemination of amateur photography, and an extended arsenal of pictorial means and options. In the 1960s, photography was promoted as a modern technological medium and was used to propagate the success of Soviet science, notably the space program.5

The methods of semiotics and the approaches of visual and cultural studies are essential to this study. Feminist critiques of visual culture, with their attention to the construction of female and male images and to the political meaning of their circulation in media production, have special significance for this type of analysis. In addition, these concrete historical images were examined in the wider cultural and political context. The importance of such an approach has been noted by many authors.6

The representation of gender was studied with regard to the characters, events, scenes and settings of pictures in which authorities and heroes of the country appeared. Attention was paid to the position of women (in the media, in the public sphere, in the family, in society, and against the backdrop of people). The representation of gender was also noted with regard to the culture of the people and the culture of the family. The image of the Soviet woman was also a subject of analysis.

The methods of semiotics and the approaches of visual and cultural studies are essential to this study. Feminist critiques of visual culture, with their attention to the construction of female and male images and to the political meaning of their circulation in media production, have special significance for this type of analysis. In addition, these concrete historical images were examined in the wider cultural and political context. The importance of such an approach has been noted by many authors.6

The representation of gender was studied with regard to the characters, events, scenes and settings of pictures in which authorities and heroes of the country appeared. Attention was paid to the position of women (in the media, in the public sphere, in the family, in society, and against the backdrop of people). The representation of gender was also noted with regard to the culture of the people and the culture of the family. The image of the Soviet woman was also a subject of analysis.

The methods of semiotics and the approaches of visual and cultural studies are essential to this study. Feminist critiques of visual culture, with their attention to the construction of female and male images and to the political meaning of their circulation in media production, have special significance for this type of analysis. In addition, these concrete historical images were examined in the wider cultural and political context. The importance of such an approach has been noted by many authors.6

The representation of gender was studied with regard to the characters, events, scenes and settings of pictures in which authorities and heroes of the country appeared. Attention was paid to the position of women (in the media, in the public sphere, in the family, in society, and against the backdrop of people). The representation of gender was also noted with regard to the culture of the people and the culture of the family. The image of the Soviet woman was also a subject of analysis.

The methods of semiotics and the approaches of visual and cultural studies are essential to this study. Feminist critiques of visual culture, with their attention to the construction of female and male images and to the political meaning of their circulation in media production, have special significance for this type of analysis. In addition, these concrete historical images were examined in the wider cultural and political context. The importance of such an approach has been noted by many authors.6

The representation of gender was studied with regard to the characters, events, scenes and settings of pictures in which authorities and heroes of the country appeared. Attention was paid to the position of women (in the media, in the public sphere, in the family, in society, and against the backdrop of people). The representation of gender was also noted with regard to the culture of the people and the culture of the family. The image of the Soviet woman was also a subject of analysis.

The methods of semiotics and the approaches of visual and cultural studies are essential to this study. Feminist critiques of visual culture, with their attention to the construction of female and male images and to the political meaning of their circulation in media production, have special significance for this type of analysis. In addition, these concrete historical images were examined in the wider cultural and political context. The importance of such an approach has been noted by many authors.6

The representation of gender was studied with regard to the characters, events, scenes and settings of pictures in which authorities and heroes of the country appeared. Attention was paid to the position of women (in the media, in the public sphere, in the family, in society, and against the backdrop of people). The representation of gender was also noted with regard to the culture of the people and the culture of the family. The image of the Soviet woman was also a subject of analysis.
timeless (“He is always with us”) and “Lenin lived, Lenin lives, Lenin will live”), the figure of Khrushchev was rooted in the present. Where Lenin’s expression “was serious, determined, thoughtful, or slightly ironic, but never jovial,” Khrushchev allowed himself to laugh, to smile broadly, and to show his emotions in other ways.

The image of power became prosaic and everyday. Periodicals did not gloss over the image of the head of state; they did not hide the features of his mediocre body.

**COMPARING WITH THE STRICT, frozen photo portraits of Stalin, from which there were few, power during the Thaw was represented more informally. Images of Stalin were glorified by the angle of the composition and the lighting, but portraits of Khrushchev did without such expression and represented the uncomplicated appearance of a Soviet bureaucrat. His clothing emphasized the ordinariness of his appearance: a jacket and tie replaced the military uniform of the Generalissimus.**

Khrushchev’s photos were published in great quantities on the pages of periodicals. He was often surrounded by people — Party members, workers, and others. Photographers often used the pages of periodicals. He was often surrounded by people — Party members, workers, and others. Photographers often used wide-angle shots of the Party’s meetings and activities, capturing not only the leader, but also his entourage. This expedient also worked to “democratize” the image of power.

**Hugs and kisses: the sensualization of power**

Corporeal confirmation of the promulgated ideas was important to the authorities during the Thaw. A hug and a kiss became a demonstration of familial relations. The hugs duplicated in the names and captions of the photographs became the norm for visual and verbal expression. “Parental” discourse was also reproduced directly by Valentina Tereshkova at a press conference in the mention of a “space brother” and Khrushchev as the “father of the newlyweds, Valentina Tereshkova and Andrian Nikolayev.” Photographs in this case reproduced the familiar story. A kiss and a hug in the Soviet photograpy of fifties and sixties belonged to the public space and often took place in front of witnesses. They were framed with people around, ordinary citizens or top government officials, which had the effect of verifying and confirming the event. There are similar situations in the Soviet cinema of that time. Hugs also expressed political support for particular nations. Khrushchev embraced Fidel Castro and black young men with emphatic enthusiasm, and held a Burmese girl and a Russian boy (“Good Hands”).

**The era of kisses** began not with Leonid Brezhnev, as many think, but in the time of the Thaw. It was then that the authorities resorted to emotional expression, to warm gestures — whether a handshake or a hug. Power involved physical contact; it became sensual and tactile. Hugs became the norm at official meetings, as evidence of a trusting relationship, but also extended to Khrushchev’s meetings with ordinary people. The emphasis on sincerity during the period demanded the confirmation of feelings by appropriate gestures.

Khrushchev and his entourage confirmed agreements and cemented their friendship with numerous hugs and kisses. Others of the epoch tried to follow suit, Khrushchev pressed German Prime Minister Willy Brandt to his chest (“Fatherly hug”); cosmonauts in turn threw themselves into each other’s arms (“Star Brothers”) as well as those of family and friends (“Joy of the Meeting”). It is noteworthy that the titles of the pictures referred to family relationships. This emphasized warmth, but at the same time signaled a hierarchy. The hugs duplicated in the names and captions of the photographs became the norm for visual and verbal expression.

Female hypostases of Soviet power: images of First Ladies

In his book *The Women’s Liberation Movement in Russia: Feminism, Nihilism, and Bolshevism*, Richard Stites points out that the Soviets never succeeded in matching educational and economic equality of the sexes with political equality on any level. From 1918 until 1924, Stasova was the only woman to appear in the Central Committee; from 1924 to 1939 there were only four women members in the Central Committee (Kolakova, Artiukhina, Krupskaia, and Kalygina). Before 1936, no woman ever sat on the Politburo or the Presidium, the chief political bodies of the Party. Nevertheless, despite their factual absence in the higher echelons of power, women were not excluded from the scope of power’s representation.

Lenin’s wife, Nadezhda Krupskaia, for example, always occupied a special place in the Soviet pantheon. She often appeared in the pictures of her high-ranking husband. A great deal of attention was given her in particular by the Sovetskaia Zhenchina magazines. The image of Krupskaia as a faithful friend and fellow member was to be an inspiration to millions of women. No female image appeared so close to power during the years that followed. None of the wives of later Soviet leaders – not Nina Krushcheva nor Raisa Gorbacheva, nor the minister of culture Ekaterina Furtseva, nor the first woman cosmonaut Valentina Tereshkova, nor many others – could begin to approach the status of the “grandmother of the Russian Revolution.” The image of Lenin’s wife remained intact as the image of Lenin, whose only competition after his death was Stalin.
The role of the First Lady changed with the Thaw. Nina Khrushcheva, who accompanied her husband on state visits, occupied a special place in relation to the higher echelons of power. For the first time, the wife of a Soviet leader was present in the pictures of official visits of the head of state. Khrushcheva was captured with her husband in a meeting with the Eisenhow- ers, and with Charles de Gaulle and Yvonne de Gaulle at the Ely- sée Palace. These photos placed Soviet leaders in a new context of high society life.

In several pictures, Nina Khrushcheva was even shown with her husband. She was seen giving interviews to American journalists, shaking hands with children, talking with the chair- man of the UN General Assembly, Victor Belaunde, communi- cating with young Frenchmen. Through these pictures, power acquired its feminine hypostasis. At the same time they empha- sized the role of women in the Soviet Union and the importance of family ties by presenting the leader of the country as a good family man.

In soviT photographs, women were represented as having power, mainly as delegates of the congress. Their role in the political life of the country was limited mainly to the declaration of women’s rights in the Soviet Union, and to the struggle for peace. Important issues that were most important at the World Congress of Women, for example, which took place in Moscow in 1965. However, although magazines wrote a great deal about the labor achievements of female workers and peasants, the So- viet era actually had created few recognizable figures of women in power.

These included the minister of culture Ekaterina Furtseva, the only woman to become a member of the Political Bureau of the Central Committee of the CPSU, and the cosmonaut Valen- tina Tereshkova. Both greeted the Soviet people from the tribune of the Mausoleum.

The most recognizable Soviet woman was Valentina Teresh- kova. Her image played an important role in the representation of women’s rights in the USSR. Tereshkova symbolized and vali- dated the victory of socialism and the equality declared by the Constitution. She was an example for all Soviet women, because she functioned in such a difficult role on a par with men. After passing the physical and intellectual trials at the same level as congress, Tereshkova proved the power of the “weaker sex”. The first woman in space was a deputy and a member of the Pre- sidium of the Supreme Soviet of the USSR and the Chairman of the Committee of Soviet Women until 1989. Her image became a symbol and guarantee of gender equality in the country, and her pictures appeared in the press on a regular basis right up until the end of the Soviet era. The vast number of members of the Politburo was a visual sign of the stagnation period. Only portraits of the general sec- retary of the CPSU could compete with their numbers. All maga- zines were crowded with photographs of Brezhnev. Even during Stalin’s cult of personality, there were not as many images of the leader as there were in the seventies. Brezhnev was everywhere: applauding from the tribune, shaking hands with workers, signing agreements at the negotiating table, receiving awards, saluting the people from the mausoleum. Pictures were staged in his speeches at the congresses, with the hall full of applauding delegates.

Leotid with Brezhnev was by no means the sole repre- sentation of power — his comrades in the Party also appeared in pictures, but no one else stood out from the faceless state apparatus. The other members of government constituted the background for the leader of the country. Among the women pictured next to Brezhnev were Indira Gandhi and Valentina Tereshkova, as well as ordinary Soviet female workers in report- age photos. Brezhnev’s wife was not featured in pictures. Even in the compilation of the family archive, which was published by Ogonek on the occasion of his seventieth birthday, her pictures were absent.34

The Gorbachev couple clearly contrasted with the tradition of downplaying family ties, appearing together at official meetings and visits abroad. For Soviet citizens such behavior presented an unusual image of power, so it caused considerable misunder- standing and annoyance. This rejection was even discussed on the pages of Sovetskaia Zherbushina, which tried to rehabilitate Raisa Gorbacheva in the eyes of the public.35

Even in the last moments of his reign, coming down the steps of the plane from Fiero with his wife and daughter, Gorbatchev was shown as a perfect family man.36 But in the eyes of the pub- lic, this was not a positive characteristic, and it did not win him any points as a political leader — quite the contrary. The post-Soviet postscript

At the beginning of the 1990s, Boris Yeltsin was portrayed in a crowd, among people, thereby embodying democratic values.37 In another shot, with dozens of microphones focused on him, he presents a visual metaphor of publicity.38 He was also shown drinking tea with the Patriarch — this meant that he respected tradition.39 In general, the new government tried to surround itself with churchmen in order to express its continuity with the preperestroika period.

At the same time that the royal family was rehabilitated, there were publications about the family relationships of royal person- ages, and about the execution in Yekaterinburg.40 Materials were accompanied by photographs of a married couple, the Tsesarev- ich, and the Grand Princesses. The declaration of preref- erentary values and a call to go “back to the roots” that came after perestroika initiated a return to the patriarchal model.

After Raisa Gorbacheva, who had irritated her compatriots because of her various activities, the figure of the First Lady vanished into the shadows for a long time. Naina Yeltsina did not appear in the press. Her absence in the pictures of her husband indicated a change in the view of the social role of women: pub- lic and private were separated even more than before. Since the election of Vladimir Putin, the First Lady has rarely been seen in the media. In the words of the Daily Beast, during the second term of Putin’s presidency, his wife was, in effect, “invisible.”41 The disappearance of Lyudmila Putin from the public sphere indicated that Putin had built his image ignoring the fam- ily context, as if she were an old bachelor.

The image of Superman — practicing judo, skiing, surfacing out of the deep sea with ancient amphoras — does not need a women’s supplement, which would simply detract from the main character. The image is created simultaneously for all women in the country. Leadership is represented in all spheres and even beyond normal human limits. He is not only the head of state, “the father of the nations”, but also the “king of beasts”, the leader, quite literally, of a flock of cranes.

The reign of Dmitry Medvedev was described by many as a weakening of vertical power. It is symptomatic that the Presi- dent’s wife became a more powerful figure at this time. Thus, the active position of the First Lady became one of the most important markers of democratic tendencies. The historical process in Rus- sia attests to this.

The relative freedom of the twenties, which created and glorified the image of the woman revolutionary in the faces of Krup- skaya and Kolontai, was replaced by the patriarchy of Stalin’s time, which passed under the shadow of the “father of nations”. After Krushchev’s Thaw, which took Nina Khrushcheva from the home into the public sphere and placed Valentina Teresh- kova on the same level as the men atop the Mausoleum, there came, with the cult of personality of Brezhnev, stagnation. The process of prerezaika weakened the old gender mindsets, but not for long. With the post-Soviet “return to the origins”, the pa- triarchal model came back, reinforced by market relations. Paternalism in its visual embodiment asserts itself through iconographic schemes which emphasize the role of the leader through the scale of his figure contrasted with other figures who depict him as the “father of nations”, the leader of the masses, and their high patron. Gestures also play an important role, express- ing trust relationships of the ruler and the people to approve the family character of their connection. Finally, the presence of the absence of the First Lady in power representations, as well as that of female politicians, also indicates the gender politics of the society. The paternalistic model depicted the woman as a monarch as a sole ruler, while the wife is reduced to at most a decorative function, to a symbol stripped of its power.

The study of images of power permits the revelation of their ideological character, and the detection of a patriarchal at- titude and the degree of authoritarianism of a regime. It thereby helps to formulate a critical position towards power, because truly democratic reforms are possible only with a change of gen- der norms, where equality is a vaccination against the scourge of autocracy.42

Ekaterina Vitushka, lecturer at the Russian State University for the Humanities in Moscow.

Kohonen pointed out ordinariness in the representation of cosmonauts. This was pointed out by several researchers. Iina

Soviet cosmonauts. This was pointed out by several researchers. Iina

Bonell, Iconography of Power, 140.

Bonell, Iconography of Power, 143.

Bonell, Iconography of Power, 144.

Bonell, Iconography of Power, 145.

Jan Hamper, Authority of Power: The Italian Cult in the Visual Arts (Macon, GA: 2001), 110.

Bonell, Iconography of Power, 145. (One example is Klutsis’s 1936 poster “Kadyky chasovnoe”, in which Stalin is posed against a red background like Christ in many icons and surrounded by smiling men and women bearing flowers. Klutsis’s poster “Kadyno chasovnoe” (1938) illustrates a perspective distortion to exaggerate Lenin and Stalin, whose giant feet are positioned near crowds of very small Bonell, Iconography of Power, 165, 166.

[Photo montage], Sovetskoe Foto 42 (1964): colored plates 42.


Veles-V.A. in Ekaterinburg, which published in a magazine format, called Veles.

The comic strips were published in 1991 on black and white newspaper. The images were called “The Collection of Comics”. Starting in 1992, the images began to be published in a magazine format, called Veles.

The authors were searching for models of their heroes in Western culture (Marda, Batman, Conan, Spider-Man, and others), Slavic mythology, the Far East, the fantastic future, fairy tales, and the historical past. Connecting mythological and media modes creates a special type of imagery, the new heroes of the USSR. Where did values they find? I studied Russian comic art produced by the publishing house Veles-V.A. in Ekaterinburg, which existed from 1991 to 1998. During this period, seven issues of the magazine Veles-V.A., two issues of humor comics, and two issues of “The Collections of Comics” were published.

The first three releases of the comic strips were published in 1991 on black and white newspaper. The images were called “The Collection of Comics”. Starting in 1992, the images began to be published in a magazine format, called Veles.

The authors were searching for models of their heroes in Western culture (Marda, Batman, Conan, Spider-Man, and others), Slavic mythology, the Far East, the fantastic future, fairy tales, and the historical past. Connecting mythological and media modes creates a special type of imagery, the new heroes of the USSR. Where did values they find? I studied Russian comic art produced by the publishing house Veles-V.A. in Ekaterinburg, which existed from 1991 to 1998. During this period, seven issues of the magazine Veles-V.A., two issues of humor comics, and two issues of “The Collections of Comics” were published.

The first three releases of the comic strips were published in 1991 on black and white newspaper. The images were called “The Collection of Comics”. Starting in 1992, the images began to be published in a magazine format, called Veles.

The authors were searching for models of their heroes in Western culture (Marda, Batman, Conan, Spider-Man, and others), Slavic mythology, the Far East, the fantastic future, fairy tales, and the historical past. Connecting mythological and media modes creates a special type of imagery, the new heroes of the USSR. Where did values they find? I studied Russian comic art produced by the publishing house Veles-V.A. in Ekaterinburg, which existed from 1991 to 1998. During this period, seven issues of the magazine Veles-V.A., two issues of humor comics, and two issues of “The Collections of Comics” were published.

The first three releases of the comic strips were published in 1991 on black and white newspaper. The images were called “The Collection of Comics”. Starting in 1992, the images began to be published in a magazine format, called Veles.

The authors were searching for models of their heroes in Western culture (Marda, Batman, Conan, Spider-Man, and others), Slavic mythology, the Far East, the fantastic future, fairy tales, and the historical past. Connecting mythological and media modes creates a special type of imagery, the new heroes of the USSR. Where did values they find? I studied Russian comic art produced by the publishing house Veles-V.A. in Ekaterinburg, which existed from 1991 to 1998. During this period, seven issues of the magazine Veles-V.A., two issues of humor comics, and two issues of “The Collections of Comics” were published.

The first three releases of the comic strips were published in 1991 on black and white newspaper. The images were called “The Collection of Comics”. Starting in 1992, the images began to be published in a magazine format, called Veles.

The authors were searching for models of their heroes in Western culture (Marda, Batman, Conan, Spider-Man, and others), Slavic mythology, the Far East, the fantastic future, fairy tales, and the historical past. Connecting mythological and media modes creates a special type of imagery, the new heroes of the USSR. Where did values they find? I studied Russian comic art produced by the publishing house Veles-V.A. in Ekaterinburg, which existed from 1991 to 1998. During this period, seven issues of the magazine Veles-V.A., two issues of humor comics, and two issues of “The Collections of Comics” were published.

The first three releases of the comic strips were published in 1991 on black and white newspaper. The images were called “The Collection of Comics”. Starting in 1992, the images began to be published in a magazine format, called Veles.

The authors were searching for models of their heroes in Western culture (Marda, Batman, Conan, Spider-Man, and others), Slavic mythology, the Far East, the fantastic future, fairy tales, and the historical past. Connecting mythological and media modes creates a special type of imagery, the new heroes of the USSR. Where did values they find? I studied Russian comic art produced by the publishing house Veles-V.A. in Ekaterinburg, which existed from 1991 to 1998. During this period, seven issues of the magazine Veles-V.A., two issues of humor comics, and two issues of “The Collections of Comics” were published.

The first three releases of the comic strips were published in 1991 on black and white newspaper. The images were called “The Collection of Comics”. Starting in 1992, the images began to be published in a magazine format, called Veles.

The authors were searching for models of their heroes in Western culture (Marda, Batman, Conan, Spider-Man, and others), Slavic mythology, the Far East, the fantastic future, fairy tales, and the historical past. Connecting mythological and media modes creates a special type of imagery, the new heroes of the USSR. Where did values they find? I studied Russian comic art produced by the publishing house Veles-V.A. in Ekaterinburg, which existed from 1991 to 1998. During this period, seven issues of the magazine Veles-V.A., two issues of humor comics, and two issues of “The Collections of Comics” were published.

The first three releases of the comic strips were published in 1991 on black and white newspaper. The images were called “The Collection of Comics”. Starting in 1992, the images began to be published in a magazine format, called Veles.

The authors were searching for models of their heroes in Western culture (Marda, Batman, Conan, Spider-Man, and others), Slavic mythology, the Far East, the fantastic future, fairy tales, and the historical past. Connecting mythological and media modes creates a special type of imagery, the new heroes of the USSR. Where did values they find? I studied Russian comic art produced by the publishing house Veles-V.A. in Ekaterinburg, which existed from 1991 to 1998. During this period, seven issues of the magazine Veles-V.A., two issues of humor comics, and two issues of “The Collections of Comics” were published.
The roots of comic art in Russia

The tradition of comic art in Russia commences with primitivistic pictures, lubki. The peculiarity of lubki is that it involves a viewer – a reader – in a kind of game with socio-political signs. In the beginning of the Soviet era, this same role is occasioned by the political poster. As Jose Alaniz writes, "visual culture forms the central front in the war of ideas. The Proletkult's projects are the primary example of this. In the second half of the twentieth century, two currents of comic strip art were formed in the Soviet Union. The first are the dissident comics. Some people who had been subject to persecution shared their experience in visual form. The most striking example is The Rock-Painting by E. Kersnovskaya. Her notebooks, which she created in the Gulag, with comments, which she inserted later, is a story transferred to a visual form – "the evidence of the historical process", as Walter Benjamin wrote. The second, official line of comic development in the USSR is children's comics. Everyone read the magazines Funny Pictures and Murzilka as a child. Here, the comic strip performs an entertaining and humorous function. It can be concluded that the comics' themes were always either burning social issues, containing direct political statements, or merely childish.

The situation changed in the 1990s. Comic art began a new life in Russia. At the beginning of the post-Soviet period, comics were produced by keen enthusiasts, who knew Western comics and admired them. With the help of such an unexpected cultural sphere in which the fears and stress of 1990s could be sublimated. Afghani stan formed their values and it is not surprising that the topic of war and defense was extremely important to the publishers.

THE DISCOURSE OF WAR in the USSR spreads far beyond the phenomena directly involving the military and its activities. V. A. Sukovataya notes that war is a family of the former university employee, Yura with his wife, son, and sister. The situation "women and children" is restored. Yura is a typical unemployed man of the developing race, which appears through the sequential presentation of ideas, involving most of all sexual liberation in the public consciousness. Even the topic of labor is understood in terms of a military struggle, such as a "feat of labor" or a "battle for the harvest". The fear on the part of the Soviet public consciousness. Its image on the screen served an ideological function in Soviet gender ideology, in which the role and the image of the soldiers is somehow incorporated into other contemporary heroic roles and images of masculinity, whether as a miner or a builder of an underground railway, a steetleapack, a commu- nized engineer, or an astronaut.

War increases collective masculine identity and forms a set of connections between the dominant masculinities, the hierarchies of homosocial power, and the politics of the male body. The discourse of protection of women and children designates the constancy of the protected. The enemy, which can also be constituted by the problem faced by labor (in the battle for the harvest, etc.), is always assigned by the state. This characterizes the the Soviet masculine identity as opposed to that of the West.

What happens to the structure of "Who is protecting whom from what?" of Orwell's political satire. This is the case of the Tin Man who tries to kill him.

But let us come back to the comic book Through Blood and Suffering. The shaky, restored structure collapses. Andrew destroys everybody, leaving only the child Sergei alive, but nearly turned into a monster, half robot, half zombie. Foreseeing trouble, Andrew still cannot kill Sergei; he takes him along instead. Here again is the logic of protection: a child needs to be protected. They fight together against savages and the communist helicopter, the pilot of which calls Andrew "the Democrat." However, it is obvious that if there is no army, the tasks to be accomplished still seem vague. As a result, Sergei attacks Andrew and turns him into a vampire.

Andrew, in turn, attacks the messenger whom he had to see. Thus, the hero is transformed into something else entirely. In this comic, the logic of the loss of identity of a Hero Defender is sequentially presented: initially it is the providers of goals that disappear – state and army (a kind of totality), then the representation of the protected individual ("women and children" turn out to be the monsters), then the enemy anyone can be an enemy, even a child, then the task (the messenger becomes the victim), and then the hero himself (I'm in a monster, not a military person).

which the subject is the main protagonist. The individual is trying to reproduce his infancy, where there are no boundary-

Search in the Slavic mythology

The example is one of the central comic strips of the maga-
azine — the serial comics story Veles. The main character is a young man called Veles, the adopted son of the Slavic god Volos. He was brought up by his servants — pseudo-mythological per-
sons — Pleshilo and Baba Yaga. Pleshilo is a small creature, who can perform magic if needed, and Baba Yaga is an old woman living in the forest. Vladimir Popov saw her as the guardian of the border between life and death, but in the comic, she is just the foster mother of the main hero.

Veles himself has a heroic, mythological body. The body of the hero has manifest gender characteristics — broad shoul-
ders, powerful trunk, muscles in sharp relief, large stature. His face also has all the signs of masculinity — wide square jaw, broad nostrils, large eyebrows, high cheekbones. There are clear similarities between the hero of the Veles series and a sav-
age man in the Western tradition such as Conan the Barbarian. Indeed, the Russian authors make no secret of their sympa-
thies: they had already published a translated comic book about

IT IS INTERESTING that at a certain moment the hero Veles turns out to be naked and then for some time continues his explora-
tions without clothes. Nudity is an important factor in the develop-
ment of the hero’s adventures. It is a sign of growth, the achieve-
ment of excellence and of superhuman status. We have already seen this in the comic story Through Blood and Suf-
f ering in the updated image of

The hero Veles fights vari-
ous enemies. Originally, the
purpose of the battles is to test himself. Having passed three tests (battles with a bear, with wolves, and with an eagle), Veles is given a task by his adoptive father Volos. The mission is extremely obscure — to get the “datura
flower” (some kind of drug, with the help of which Al-
mighty Volos will supposedly conquer all people — but this is unknown to the hero). Hav-
ing received the task, the hero, without further questions, begins to execute it — it is a
comfortable situation for him, as we have already seen. He has
incredible strength and the ability to conjure. However, there is
one condition — loving a woman will deprive the hero of

In general, images of women are rare in the pages of these col-
clections and only four types can be found: a friend or compan-
ion-in-arms, a forbidden sexual object, an enemy, and a mon-
ster. Often a woman who is initially attractive turns into an ugly
monster, threatening the hero’s life.

At a certain stage in the adventure, Veles meets a beauti-

ful girl, Vesnyana, who attracts him, but the formidable Old Queen
of the country tries to shift the hero’s attention to herself. The
hero turns both women down because he remembers that love
can strip him of his strength. As a result, young Vesnyana is re-
placed by an older woman, an enemy, who in the end causes the
loss of a young lover and an attack on the hero by a huge swarm
of wasps. The hero cannot influence the events, so he does not
respond to the rupture of relations with his beloved.

The comics’ authors try to oppose the Soviet pattern of sup-
pressed, injured masculinity to an ideal image, an “I-man” of

flourishing physicality and sexuality. But it is still suppressed by
pressed, injured masculinity to an ideal image, an “I-man” of

of a task and the activities involved

in executing it.

The comics about West-
ern heroes, from Conan to Batman, from

Neither Batman nor
other adapted characters can reduce the stress asso-
ciated with the loss of

The authors of
these comics enthusiastically and expertly replicate the orgi-

al stylistics of the prototype, but cannot de-

There is a selection for their type of
heroic character, cannot give him a fully developed
life in the literary work.

The comics about West-
ern heroes are episcodic; they do not occupy a sig-
nificant part in the pages of the issues, being rather a kind of literacy campaign in

the culture of comics rather than a serious attempt to set the behavioral model of a
Western hero before the Russian reader.

The appeal to a variety of Western heroes, from

set the value of the

of a new type of masculinity — takes place in comics in several ways: in mythology, in Western popular culture, and in fictional

tory.16 The main character Ivan endures challenging trials and

tribulations during the war in Afghanistan. He loses friends, and

witnesses death, cowardice, and heroism. At home waiting for

his girlfriend. . . . The authors narrate their experiences of the

war in Afghanistan, and the comic book receives the greatest re-

sponse, judging by letters reprinted from readers.

“Each generation has its own war — the Civil War, the Great

Patriotic War, Afghanistan. . . .” says Ivan, the Red Blood com-
ics’ hero, to his girlfriend before his mobilization. Ivan reprodu-

ces the most important Soviet male identity; that of the warrior-
defender. “War, as an experience of gender policy, is one of the

key methods of forming the male/virile body,” the researcher

Irina Novikova says.17 The authors classify this comics as a documentary, inscrib-

ing it in the tradition of such works as The Rock-Painting by

Maus, a Holocaust survivor by Art Spiegelman, is one of the graphic novels about a Jewish family that is not to be "testified". 

Further events unfold around the hero’s service in Afghanistan, his military missions and Afghan fighters, the mujahideen. A man’s body is a soldier’s body. At the level of the plot, the comic story gradually unfolds from the memory complex about the Soviet era to the chaos of war and captivity; however, the hero does not lose himself in it. This is no longer the post-apocalyptic chaos of the comic Through Blood and Suffering, and the enemy is not a fantastic monster, but one designated by the state: in the first issue the hero says that he must “fulfill his international duty in Afghanistan”. 

The appeal to the topic of war symbolically restores the order connected with the structure of a warrior-defender, and produces a powerful nostalgic impulse, forcing authors and readers, as early as 1993, to turn to the Soviet past for the reconstruction of male identity. 

The hero remembers “his war”, and, following him, we encounter history. According to Benjamin,7 modernity takes the image of destroyer of the present. The present is dissolved in the past, transformed into debris before the eyes of the astonished angel of history.

His face is turned towards the past. Where we see the appearance of a chain of events, we see one single catastrophe, which unceasingly piles rubble on top of rubble and hurls it before his feet. He would like to pause for a moment so fair... to awaken the dead and to piece together what has been smashed. But a storm is blowing from Paradise, it has caught itself up in the storm, it is to compensate for the collapse of the male identity that occurred after the collapse of the Soviet state system.

As we have seen, the “Hero-Defender” type of masculinity was shaped in the Soviet discourse, for which the most important structuring phenomenon is war. The entire reality of work and family life is also understood as a military situation, in which every man has a clearly defined place – he was the defender of "women and children" from an enemy assigned by the state.

The man still remains passive and depressed, he did not choose his goals, and in the job assigned him by the State and the Party, it is not his duty to try to achieve for himself and his family any kind of well-being, but rather to defend and protect.

Comic thus appear in the crisis period of rupture with the traditional Soviet masculinity and become the bearers of traces of this trauma. The authors of comics try to find new hero models, searching for them in Slavonic mythology and in Western culture. In the second half of the 1990s, they produce the comic book Red Blood, which returns to the figure of the war, allowing the hero to reconstruct his identity nostalgically, and to survive the traumatic experience of the crisis of the 1990s. A man returns to his past and finds confidence in himself in the present. Since the late 1990s, this process still has not been completed. Designing one’s own history, fantasizing about it, giving it additional values and meanings – this is one of the strongest trends in the contemporary Russian culture. Symbolization of the experience of the past to overcome the crisis gave rise to the liquidation of historical reality as a whole. In its place, it creates a wonderful new past where it is possible to find the necessary identity – the patriarchal warrior – as if the 1990s had never happened.

Daria Ombriova, lecturer in the history of cultures, Russia State University of the Humanities, Moscow.

Conclusions: which identity then?

The Veles’A comics present a broad, complete coverage of the social problems of the transition to the post-Soviet period, and, in symbolic form, represent for the Russian reader a new form of entertaining comics. This form becomes not so much simply a guide to new values, but, to a greater extent, a mirror that reflects the complex of the loss of male identity that occurred after the collapse of the Soviet state system.

As we have seen, the “Hero-Defender” type of masculinity was shaped in the Soviet discourse, for which the most important structuring phenomenon is war. The entire reality of work and family life is also understood as a military situation, in which every man has a clearly defined place – he was the defender of “women and children” from an enemy assigned by the state.

The man still remains passive and depressed, he did not choose his goals, and in the job assigned him by the State and the Party, it is not his duty to try to achieve for himself and his family any kind of well-being, but rather to defend and protect.

Comic thus appear in the crisis period of rupture with the traditional Soviet masculinity and become the bearers of traces of this trauma. The authors of comics try to find new hero models, searching for them in Slavonic mythology and in Western culture. In the second half of the 1990s, they produce the comic book Red Blood, which returns to the figure of the war, allowing the hero to reconstruct his identity nostalgically, and to survive the traumatic experience of the crisis of the 1990s. A man returns to his past and finds confidence in himself in the present. Since the late 1990s, this process still has not been completed. Designing one’s own history, fantasizing about it, giving it additional values and meanings – this is one of the strongest trends in the contemporary Russian culture. Symbolization of the experience of the past to overcome the crisis gave rise to the liquidation of historical reality as a whole. In its place, it creates a wonderful new past where it is possible to find the necessary identity – the patriarchal warrior – as if the 1990s had never happened.

Daria Ombriova, lecturer in the history of cultures, Russian State University of the Humanities, Moscow.

References

3. J. Alaniz, Comic Art in Russia. (Jackson: Mississippi University Press, 2010).
6. The PhP, created by Vitaly Mikhailentlyanov, was the first Soviet and Russian periodic comic magazine published between 1971 and 1974.
12. Conan the Barbarian was the brainchild of Robert E. Howard, a pulp fiction writer from Cross Plains, Texas. Conan’s first official appearance in comics was in Conan the Barbarian #1 published in 1970 by Marvel Comics. Internet comics database: http://www.comicrave.com/.
14. In the ‘70s, various authors worked on stories about Batman. Marc Williamson’s work is the most interesting. His stories Batman is set in a Russian context. See: The Batman (New York: DC, 1959) 444–445.
Studies on men and masculinities in Ukraine

Dynamics of (under) Development

by Tetyana Bureychak

Gender studies in Western academia

Academic interest in the analysis of men and masculinities from a gender perspective is quite recent, not only in post-Soviet countries, but also in Anglo-Saxon countries (Australia, the US, and Great Britain), where this field of studies primarily emerged. The explicit emergence of this field dates back only to the late 1970s. The initial interest in men and masculinities from a gender perspective is related to the second wave of feminism, as well as to other, rather mixed factors, such as gay liberation movements, the spread of both pro-feminist and antifeminist men’s rights organizations, growing public concerns with the changing roles of men, and debates on the crisis of femininity. Despite the different agendas pursued by these initiatives — which ranged from criticizing and combating patriarchy to protecting men’s traditional roles — they contributed to the recognition of men’s gendered experience and questioned the concept of masculinity. Strengthening emancipatory movements and discourses related to gender and sexuality coincided with the development of gender, LGBT, queer, and men and masculinities studies in academia in North America and Europe. The pro-feminist men and masculinities studies aimed to contribute to a more critical analysis of men’s experiences, one that did not solely focus on empowering women, but instead constituted an important exploration of gender power relations by looking at how power is reproduced, sustained, and normalized in relation to men. To emphasize this pro-feminist orientation of the contemporary research, the field is sometimes labeled “critical studies on men and masculinities”.

The dominant analytical perspectives in men and masculinities studies have been substantially reconsidered since the late 1970s. The key emphasis of the first wave of studies on men and masculinities was to demonstrate the socially constructed nature of masculinity and its detrimental effects on men’s psychological and physical well-being, but since then — as a result of the immense criticism this approach received — the focus has shifted to complex relations of masculinity and power. The second wave of studies on men and masculinities studies (since the 1980s) emphasized the limitations of sex role theory and drew attention to phallicities of men’s experiences. Inspired by Gramsci’s theory of hegemony, R. W. Connell introduced the concept of hegemonic masculinity, which has become one of the most influential in the field. The third wave of men and masculinities studies (since the two thousand aughts) has been inspired by post-structuralism, intersectionality theories, and queer and postcolonial studies. It has deepened the focus of analysis on material and discursive gender power relations, and on linkages between social action, power, and fluid, contingent, and performative identity processes. Despite the growing recognition of cultural diversities and global and transnational processes, the Anglo-Saxon tradition continues to dominate men and masculinities studies.

Challenges of the post-Soviet context

The post-Soviet context represents diversity of political, social, and gender agendas that are rather different from those found in Western Europe and North America. Although particular aspects of gender agendas in post-Soviet states may vary due to local political, economic, cultural, and religious situation, the Soviet heritage is one of the important common reference points in the process of establishing new gender hierarchies. It affects the current national building processes and visions of gender relations. One of the most important peculiarities of some post-Soviet countries, including Ukraine, lies in the parallel coexistence of mutually exclusive gender agendas, i.e. gender-egalitarian and gender-traditional discourse. The former reflects the aspiration of the country to be seen as a part of Europe and to follow democratic traditions. Ukraine is one of the few post-Soviet countries that has adopted a special law on equal rights and opportunities of women and men. It offers an overview of the dynamics and contextual peculiarities of the development of men and masculinities studies, questions their comparability with Western history of this discipline, and discusses the potential of this field of study in the post-Soviet context.

abstract

Despite the growing field of gender studies in the post-Soviet context, issues of men and masculinities remain on the fringe of academic interest. This paper discusses the underrepresentation of men and masculinities in the post-Soviet context with a particular focus on Ukraine. It offers an overview of the dynamics and contextual peculiarities of the development of men and masculinities studies, questions their comparability with Western history of this discipline, and discusses the potential of this field of study in the post-Soviet context.

key words: men and masculinities studies, gender, post-Soviet context, Ukraine.

gender egalitarian principles in the current Ukrainian legislation, the dominant public discourses and practices remain patriarchal.

The popularity of the gender-traditional discourse is largely connected to resistance to the communist past, a resistance that has become vital for the framing of national identity in the post-Soviet Ukraine. According to the new national narratives, restoration of traditional gender relations is often presented as a way to revitalize the Ukrainian nation, to preserve the family, and to renew moral traditions that the Soviet society was supposed to destroy. These views have received particular support from the national media, as well as from political, religious, and non-governmental organizations. This tendency, also common in other postcommunist and postsocialist countries, is sometimes referred to as a “patriarchal renaissance”.

The situation in recent years is particularly aggravated by the advent of “anti-gender organizations”, by the intensification of a self-styled “moral agenda”, and by legislative initiatives to ban abortion and “propaganda for homosexual- ity”. There has been a wide range of initiatives of far-right and religious groups aimed at the protection of traditional Christian values, the traditional family, and national identity. The form of these initiatives has varied from Internet attacks and trolling of organizations and persons promoting gender equality issues to the organization of massive street demonstrations (called “family carnivals”) and violent attacks against events and people connected with LGBT issues. The common discourse behind most
of these initiatives and attacks emphasizes corrupt morality, a weakening of the institution of the family, and the undermining of national traditions, all of which are seen as consequences of gender equality politics, feminism, and the visibility of the LGBT community.

Promoting pro-feminist gender studies in such conditions is rather challenging, as it goes against the dominant political and public discourses. Although women and gender studies are taught in many Ukrainian universities, the field is still not formally recognized. Even where courses on gender studies have been introduced, they often have a marginal status within the curriculum and are treated as unimportant and unserious, e.g., as an attempt to follow fashion, or as a mere diversion for the students. Apart from the symbolic devaluation of gender studies, some other common challenges for the development of this academic field are connected with the dearth of good academic resources in the Ukrainian and Russian languages, the inaccessibility of international academic databases and the most recent international scholarship in the field, and the limited number of translated works even by the classical gender studies and feminist writers. Although this situation has improved, the problem remains significant. All these challenges are highly relevant to men and masculinities studies.

**GENDER STUDIES** in the post-Soviet context originated from women’s studies. Despite the broadening of the scope of problems discussed and the diversification of the research agenda of the humanities and social sciences by the recent addition of gender perspectives, the focus on women remains dominant in the academic and public discourse. The academic interest in men and masculinities in the post-Soviet space has emerged in gender studies in Ukraine. An explicit academic interest in the gender perspectives, the focus on women remains dominant in the humanities and social sciences by the recent addition of relevant to men and masculinities studies.

**Western theories and post-Soviet practices**

The influence of the Anglo-Saxon theoretical traditions on the development of men and masculinities studies in the post-Soviet context is evident on at least two levels — terminological and theoretical. The Anglo-Saxon terminology in gender studies is widely applied and integrated in the vocabulary of post-Soviet gender studies. It has, in particular, resulted in the transliteration of the term “masculinity” and its validation as a category of gender analysis. This shows that it was easier to adopt what was, in the local context, a relatively new term, instead of redesigning the semantically loaded term muchnist (“masculinity” in Ukrainian).

Another influence of the Anglo-Saxon theoretical tradition on the post-Soviet men and masculinities studies is the application of Anglo-Saxon theories in the analysis of post-Soviet masculinities and men’s experiences. The problematization of the applicability of the Western theoretical heritage to the post-Soviet context is not unique and has been discussed by gender studies scholars for a long time. This discussion is also highly relevant to men and masculinities studies, which, due to the regional nature of this field, is not developed as much. The problem of the applicability of theoretical models that would be able to capture the peculiarities of the local masculinities. Given the insufficiency of local methodological and theoretical terms from the West, becomes almost inevitable. To legitimate this practice, Igor Kon remarks that, since there is much more research on men and masculinities conducted in the West, it is likely that the quality of the research is higher. “If you have little milk, how can you get the cream?” he asks, metaphorically referring to the insufficiency and potentially lower quality of the local research on men and masculinities. At the same time, the application of theoretical tools developed in a different context may be problematic, which is not commonly recognized by the post-Soviet scholars.

**The potential of studies in the post-Soviet context**

Apart from many structural problems that hinder the development of critical research on men and masculinities, an important problem is the not development of research on male masculinities in the post-Soviet context is misunderstanding or undervaluation of their potential by gender studies scholars in Ukraine. An important factor contributing to the discussion of men and masculinities is the recognition and demonstration that gender is not only about women. Critical research on men and masculinities in the post-Soviet context aimed to balance the gender perspective and demonstrate that gender is not only about women. Critical research on men and masculinities in the post-Soviet context aimed to balance the gender perspective and demonstrate that gender is not only about women.
The article analyzes discourses and practices of gender equality as a part of Nordic cooperation with Northwestern Russia. I explore how ideas and institutions of gender equality were approached by those involved and what problems of "translation" were present. While some of the representatives of the local authorities in Northwestern Russia saw cooperation on gender equality as an opportunity to realize the new ideas, in most of the cases the Soviet style interpretation of women’s issues as a part of "social problems" and protection of motherhood prevailed.

abstract

The article analyzes discourses and practices of gender equality as a part of Nordic cooperation with Northwestern Russia. I explore how ideas and institutions of gender equality were approached by those involved and what problems of “translation” were present. While some of the representatives of the local authorities in Northwestern Russia saw cooperation on gender equality as an opportunity to realize the new ideas, in most of the cases the Soviet style interpretation of women’s issues as a part of “social problems” and protection of motherhood prevailed.

key words: gender equality, Northwestern Russia, Nordic-Russian cooperation.
The cooperative activities that included the civil servants varied, including invitations to join the delegations from different subregions of Northwestern Russia to big international conferences, training for personnel and volunteers of the crisis centers, big yearly women’s forums (such as the one in Karelia), and excursions for civil servants, leaders of women’s organizations, gender researchers, ombuds, and other representatives of Russian society to the Nordic countries in order to observe how gender equality institutions function there. As is the case with other international and national organizations seeking to spread ideas on gender equality and women’s rights, Nordic agencies and organizations saw distribution of knowledge about democracy, gender, and discrimination to be one of the important aims of cooperation. Indeed, the partners in Russian subregions were expected to learn about democratic citizenship and ways of defending equality of rights of all the citizens regardless of their gender and sexual identity.

The documents produced in connection with the cooperative efforts mainly showed “best practices”, and presented the Nordic countries as the gender equality experts. At the same time, the Nordic cooperation partners mostly ignored the fact that the Russian population was well familiar with the ideas of equality between men and women due to Soviet equality policies. For example, the President of the Nordic Council, Ramweg Gudmundsdottir, in her speech in St Petersburg in 2005, expressed the hope that one day Russia would experience the same level of gender equality as women in the West: “Little by little, they [the Russian women] are also beginning to enjoy the same opportunities to play an active part in society and politics as women in the West have enjoyed for decades now.” Such an evaluation of the situation in Russia paved the way for joining the transnational feminist agenda on the promotion of women’s rights in Russia and “unproblematically” making a connection between positive changes for women and the end of state socialism and the beginning of democratization. In the process of cooperation, the positive Nordic experience of gender equality and democracy had to be “translated into Russian” – linguistically but also in terms of more general social adaptation. However, it was no easy task taking into account the Soviet history of the politics of “equality of women and men”. For example, the “big campaigns” typical of feminist organizations in Western Europe did not work properly in the post-Soviet space: these campaigns were rather suspect to the extent that they were “too connected to the practices used during the period of state socialism”. Furthermore, the Nordic model of gender equality was inseparable from the ideas of women’s participation in wage labor and the goal of achieving the same economic status as men. However, as had been shown in the publications on cooperation with American feminist organizations, many women in Russia (as well as many women in other parts of the world) did not see work as “unproblematically liberal”,” especially under current neoliberal trends.

Obstacles and possibilities for gender equality

The collected interviews and documents show that the reactions of the local civil servants from the different levels of the subregional hierarchy to the gender equality as a goal for cooperation were diverse. At the beginning, in the mid-1990s, the subregional and local authorities were rather surprised when confronted with the expectation that they support the NGOs working for gender equality and the prevention of discrimination on the grounds of gender. The story told to me by the head of the Gender Center in Karelia, LB, illustrates this very well.

When LB, after attending the Beijing conference and a couple of other international meetings of European Eastern women supported by the Nordic Council of Ministers, returned to Petrozavodsk, Karelia, and established her organization there, she decided to start a cooperative effort with the subregional authorities. However, the local authorities were not ready for such cooperation, she recalled bitterly. Indeed, she had to explain to the representatives of the regional government that “Russia has signed all these (international) documents on gender, thus (at the level of the region) they should be followed”. The local civil servants did not trust her and wrote a letter to the Ministry of Family Affairs in St Petersburg asking for explanations with regard to the documents that were signed by the Russian state. According to LB, after receiving confirmation from Moscow, and after numerous long discussions, the head of the local administration finally decided in 1998 to create the special commission dedicated to the situation of women in Karelia.

Later on, following the tactics learned in the seminars on lobbyists for women’s issues that had been arranged as part of cooperative efforts, LB and her colleagues attempted to get the female civil servants interested in women’s NGOs, and women’s rights. It was by no means easy, however:

“We were trying to engage women from the government in our work. We were drinking with some of them, had dinner with the others, were helping to take care of others’ children – so everybody had the possibility of getting involved.”

In time, however, the civil servants from different regions and levels started to participate in the projects involving crisis centers, support for women’s NGOs and the organization of seminars and workshops on different issues related to gender equality. My study on civil servants supports mainly the data received by several researchers with respect to the rapid growth of women’s organizations in Russia; it was usually explained with the help of “window of opportunity” theories. Much like those NGO leaders who, in the situation of civil society activism became popular after the years of “stagnation” under late socialism, wanted to use their organizational skills and ideas related to the opportunity provided by grants to support new women’s organizations, some of the civil servants were ready to take advantage of possibilities for cooperation in order to use their organizational skills and to bring some of those institutions that were functioning abroad into Russia and display their usefulness.

The subregion that probably achieved most in the way of the visibility of gender-related issues was the Northwest region and for Russia as a whole due to the unique document for the Northwest region and for Russia as a whole due to its direct use of “gender equality” in the text. In addition, the state…
The implementation of gender equality

The ideas and institutions of “gender equality” that were brought by the Nordic countries to Northwestern Russia were, as noted above, usually presented as components of the programs for the support of democracy and development. However, the collected material shows, most of the local leaders of women’s organizations as well as civil servants involved in the gender equality programs had to translate these ideas and institutions into the local context. Such a context-driven adaptation often led to significant changes in the interpretations of goals and policies connected to the sphere of women’s rights and the improvement of the situation of women. As my informant C, the gender researcher and participant in the elaboration of the St Petersburg gender equality statement, conveyed to me, “gender” in the title of the regional program could be seen as a kind of neutral and unproblematic term: “It is something nice and not very clear, not like ‘women’ or ‘feminism’.

Indeed, many of my interviewees, even when discussing issues of rights and discrimination, were still focusing on social rights and their “gender” aspects. Thus, GM, the civil servant from Novgorod, was proud that, during the years of active cooperation with foreign countries, the gender references from the university actively cooperated with local authorities and influenced the policy documents: the program for improvement of the situation of women in the Novgorod subregion was adopted. Still, as IB, the leader of an organization of businesswomen closely involved with the local authorities, sees it, it was not exactly a program trying to increase equality:

But the focus was on the social problems. It was not about women’s education and transformation. It provided support for families with many children, the organization of holidays. . . . It was from 2001.

At the same time, IB mentioned financial problems as a significant impediment to the successful collaboration of women’s organizations and local authorities in following the Nordic way:

Concerning the Swedish experience, for example, we were trying to create these resource centers. We know how it should be. But nobody gave us money. In practice, we continue working as such a resource center — we give consultations, we help different women find places in different structures. But, as opposed to Sweden, there is no support for such resource centers that deal with women entrepreneurs, or women trying to participate in decision-making at a different level. And there (in Sweden), such organizations could get money for an office, for activities, some small salaries. We do not have anything like that.

H, a civil servant from St Petersburg positioned rather high in the local hierarchy, presented the development of cooperation with Nordic countries and the progress of gender equality policies in St Petersburg as Soviet-style stories about “victorious progress”, in which “socialism” seems to have been replaced by “gender equality”. She was ready to recognize the importance of cooperation, especially in the early post-Soviet period: “We must be grateful to those programs, the humanitarian assistance, the help to families, women, and children, those who receive state financing in order to “perform tasks and provide services important for the state”2 — the feminist or political women’s organizations were not mentioned at all.

Finally, another civil servant from St Petersburg, J, remembering the story of local politics on gender equality, stated that even if the difficult word “gender” was not easy to explain, the campaign for gender equality was more a success than a failure: It was the first plan in Russia for gender equality for women. . . . We made an agreement with all the heads of administration in the city — there are 18 — we made an agreement with all the heads of the committees, thus we received 63 confirmations. . . . And everywhere we had to explain: What should be done so that men and women are equal and for the term “gender equality” to be used like other Russian words. In this way, we explained what “gender” means."

Conclusion

On the basis of the material studied, we find that cooperation on gender equality issues was a difficult task with contradictory outcomes. While now it seems obvious that the political agenda of gender equality has failed in Russia (at least for the term of the current political leadership), and that the current Russian government is not interested in independent women’s organizations protecting rights and democracy, the collected materials show rather a complex picture of local discourses and evaluations of attempts to implement gender equality in the region during the last twenty years. Indeed, in some situations, the previous participation of the Russian local authorities and other state-related bodies in such cooperative efforts seems to be manipulative — an attempt to use cooperation and “gender” for their own political goals, in other cases, though, civil servants sincerely tried to cooperate with women’s organizations in order to establish institutions that would protect the rights of women. In such cases, however, their interpretations frequently seem to be more in accordance with Soviet notions of “solutions to women’s problems”.

Nevertheless, the emphasis on social problems and social rights made by many of my interviewees (as opposed to the emphasis on democracy assistance promoted by most of the Nordic cooperation programs) could also be seen as an attempt to pay attention to the “local problems”, to be more in accord with the post-Soviet context in which neoliberal economic reforms contributed to a decrease in the standard of living for a large part of the population, especially in regard to family welfare. Even if this emphasis on the “social” as opposed to the “political” could easily be explained by the growing strength of the authoritarian regime in Russia, the social aspects of the “women’s question” in contemporary Russia could hardly be ignored (see, for example, recent publications of the Egida organization from St Petersburg dealing with the protection of women’s rights as workers3).

Finally, the unsuccessful “translation” of “gender equality” into Russian reveals numerous difficulties and indicates that the realization of the transnational feminist agenda could meet with serious obstacles not only in the countries of the “Third World”, but also in some former “Second World” countries.

References

1 The Russian Federation consists of 83 subregions, most of which are called oblast. Among the other subregions are 2 autonomous republics and two federal cities, Moscow and St Petersburg. The Northwestern Federal District (Novgorod-Zapadnyi federalnyy okrug), or Northwest Russia, is one of the federal districts of the Russian Federation. It consists of eleven subjects of the Russian Federation, including the city

PHOTO: EPA © EU/NEIGHBOURHOOD INFO

Training on gender inequality in a school in Smolensk, Russia, as part of the EU Partnership, September 24, 2011.

A sustainable society requires gender equality, because a work force that includes women creates a more sustainable economy.
of St. Petersburg, the Republic of Karelia, and the Archangelsk, Novgorod, Murmansk, and Kaliningrad oblasts.

2 This had already been ratified under the Soviet Union, in 1981.


4 “Mourning becomes Electra: Gender discrimination and human rights: altered relations among international organs, collectives and individuals from a Nordic and Eastern European perspective 1980–2009”. The project was realized in 2010–2014 and supported by the Swedish Research Council and Baltic Sea Foundation.


7 Interview with CP, former coordinator of the Nordic Council of Ministers, Copenhagen, October 2012.


9 See e.g. Johnny Rodin, Rethinking Russian Federalism: The politics of Intergovernmental Relationships and Federal Reforms in the Turn of the Millennium, (Stockholm: Stockholm University Press, 2006); Aleksandr Sungurov, Institut Ombudsmana: Traditsii i Sovremennaia Praktika [The ombudsman institution: traditions and contemporary situation] (St. Peterburg: Norma, 2005); Rimashewskaia et al, Prava zhenshchin.

10 Interview with Z, Norden coordinator, St Petersburg, May 2013.


15 The problems of women’s work during the rapid transformation of the labor market is also discussed in a Swedish context: see Kvinnorna och krisen: Leder regeringens investeringar till en jämställd framtid? [Women and the crises: do government’s investments lead to the equal future?] (Stockholm: Sveriges Kvinnolobby [Swedish Women’s Lobby], 2013).